City of Lewisburg Historic Landmarks Commission Meeting Minutes ~ April 12, 2021 942 Washington Street West, Lewisburg, WV Via Teleconference

<u>PRESENT</u>: Commission Chair Paul Lindquist; Commission members, Skip Deegans, Clifford Gillilian, Donna Johns; Planning & Zoning Officer Marsha Cunningham, Architect Consultant Michael Mills, Recording Officer Peggy Mackenzie

ABSENT: Commission member David Craddock

<u>VISITORS</u>: Chuck Hancock, Isak Howell, Andrew Must, Roger & Tamera Pence, Randy Phillips, Bob Pollard, Martin Schleiff, Elizabeth Wickline

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order at 5:01 p.m. by Commission Chair Paul Lindquist. No public comments were offered.

<u>APPROVAL OF MINUTES</u>: The minutes of <u>February 8, 2021</u> were approved as corrected in a motion by Commission member Skip Deegans and seconded by Commission member Donna Johns. With four (4) in favor and one (1) absent, the motion carried.

<u>Public hearing:</u> Appalachian Headwaters, Inc., 122 Courtney Drive ~ 5 Projects: Replace roof; Construct retaining wall; Replace windows; Remove 2 chimneys; Replace rear deck

Property owner Isak Howell proposed five projects for the early twentieth century wood-framed residential structure with a stone foundation and a metal roof. The first being to replace the worn tin shingle roofing with a true standing seam metal with no striations in Burnished Slate, to match the metal roofing on the front porch. HLC discussion included confirming the width of panels at a standard 16 inches and that the need for attic venting be addressed since there is currently no venting present, to not employ folded cones for rib gaps, and the starter strip must have even closures. Architect Consultant Michael Mills also confirmed flashing details at the chimneys be standard step flashing and match color of roofing. **Project two** involved construction of a low retaining wall on the up-hill west side of the residence where water damage and dirt build up have threatened the foundation. Contractor Andrew Must stated the plan is to excavate around the foundation and change the grade away from it and then install a low retaining wall four feet away from the structure. Must proposed brick veneer on the cap and the side facing away from the residence. Smooth concrete was a second option for the wall surface finish. Commission member Deegans offered the only comment stating the brick cap was preferred with either finish to the wall. With the third project, Howell proposed to replace all the windows in the house, which are non-functioning single-pane, with Anderson series E aluminum clad in the same dimension and color (white) as the originals. All windows are two over twos except those on the east porch, which are six over sixes. Must confirmed all will be replaced with same. Mills affirmed the choice of the Anderson windows. The removal of two chimneys as the fourth project received some resistance from the HLC. Though nonfunctional and crumbling and the interiors of the chimneys removed, Chair Lindquist remarked that they add architecturally as an original feature of the structure, even if they do not function. Deegans concurred, stating the chimneys should remain and be repointed. The fifth and final project is the removal of a non-original deck at the rear of the house to be replaced with a roofed, 5 by 5-foot, painted stoop to a side entry door. A shed roof was suggested by Mills, installed with standing seam metal roofing.

City of Lewisburg Historic Landmarks Commission Meeting Minutes ~ April 12, 2021 A motion to approve the five-part application, with the conditions that the chimneys are not removed and a standing seam metal roof with true folded ridge cap be installed to all roof surfaces, was made by Commission member Deegans and seconded by Commission member Clifford Gillilian. With four (4) in favor and one (1) absent, the motion carried.

Public Hearing: Roger Pence, 185 Green Lane ~ Install wood and wire 6-foot fence

Owner Roger Pence proposed to install a custom wire and wood privacy fence around the garage area at the rear of the property with boards of fir and pine on top, reaching a height of 6 feet. The wood will be painted a moss green to match the house. Lindquist said Pence will need to schedule to apply with the Board of Zoning Appeals for approval of a height variance. A motion to approve the fence as proposed was made by Commission member Johns and seconded by Commission member Deegans. With four (4) in favor and one (1) absent, the motion carried.

Public Hearing: Elizabeth Wickline, 204 Randolph Street ~ Paint exterior of house

Elizabeth Wickline requested to paint the body of her office building a soft gray color with white trim and the doors in a reddish color. She said any rot or other deterioration will be addressed. A motion to approve as presented was made by Commission member Deegans and seconded by Commission member Johns. With four (4) in favor and one (1) absent, the motion carried.

Public Hearing: Robert Pollard, 471 Church Street ~ Replace steps and paint handrails

The proposal by Bob Pollard to replace some broken and hazardous stone steps with wood steps was not considered by the HLC members to be an appropriate option. "Stone stairs make a statement to a house," said Commission member Clifford Gillilian, Deegans said, according to the National Parks Service, there are three guideline options: 1) repair the stone steps, 2) replace those ruined, 3) use a combination of existing stone and recast steps in cement, tinted to match. Mills agreed, adding that the problem with the broken steps results from a systemic issue occurring below ground where a solid footer was not in place, with freezing and thawing contributing factors. In the discussion that followed, contractor Chuck Hancock said he would rather not recast and tint concrete, calling it labor intensive and too costly. He was advised to try and join two pieces of the stone together at the center, using as much as possible of the original stone, and then to seek a local available stone source to replace the remaining steps. Mills said he could recommend a representative of Indiana Linestone (the original stone source) to Hancock if needed. A motion to approve and proceed with the recommendation noted above was made by Commission member Gillilian and seconded by Commission member Johns. With four (4) in favor and one (1) absent, the motion carried.

<u>Public Hearing:</u> James DeHaven, 1255 Washington Street east ~ Relocate shed, clad with Hardiplank siding, paint to match garage, and reroof to match the house

Contractor Martin Schleiff said owner James DeHaven wants the shed moved from its present location, rotated 90 degrees and then given an elaborate renovation as a summer hobby project. The structure is to be painted to match the main house, given a new roof, decorative moldings and have the recycled original windows from the house installed as well. A motion to approve as presented was made by Commission

City of Lewisburg Historic Landmarks Commission Meeting Minutes ~ April 12, 2021 Page 3 member Deegans and seconded by Commission member Johns. With four (4) in favor and one (1) absent, the motion carried.

<u>Public Hearing: Patrick Shen, 1574 Washington Street East</u> Expand back porch, add paver patio, paint and shingles to match existing

Schleiff stated the owner Patrick Shen requests to create a small 10 by 17-foot, covered paver patio in the at the rear of the residence, extending the porch roof along the kitchen exterior wall. The roofing material will be black architectural shingles to match existing. All wood materials will match existing white siding and trim. A motion to approve as presented was made by Commission member Johns and seconded by Commission member Deegans. With four (4) in favor and one (1) absent, the motion carried.

<u>Public Hearing:</u> Joan Yarid, 885 Washington Street East ~ Demolition garage, upgrade drainage to the parking lot, repair parking lot, repair sidewalks and add a 6-foot wooden fence to match existing fence, and add landscaping

Zoning Officer Marsha Cunningham described the application from owner Joan Yarid for the demolition of the garage at the rear of the residence on McClung Street, including the removal of asbestos materials. All returned receipts and permits and other requirements have been met. The parking lot drainage, repaving, sidewalk repairs, fence addition and landscaping will complete the upgrades to the property. A motion to approve as presented was made by Commission member Deegans and seconded by Commission member Gillilan. With four (4) in favor and one (1) absent, the motion carried.

<u>Public Hearing: Old Stone Presbyterian Church, 644 Church Street ~ Remove 3-tab shingled roof and install Williamsburg Gray Owens Corning architectural shingles and repair underlayment</u>

As described by Office Project Manager Randy Phillips, the roof of the church's educational building need replacement shingles. The nonfunctioning vents in the roof will be removed with the installation of the new architectural shingles. A motion to approve as presented was made by Commission member Gillilian and seconded by Commission member Johns. With four (4) in favor and one (1) absent, the motion carried.

<u>Public Hearing: Travis Eades, 721 Jefferson Street</u> Extend kitchen and upstairs laundry room, enclose breeze way

Katie Eades began by initially described the plan to connect the house and garage by enclosing the breeze way to create an inside mud room before entering the kitchen, which would mean raising the floor level to the house and would also require raising the height of the flat roof in that area. Eades said an effort was made to get architectural drawings from Jerry Janiga, but they could not be available for another month, which put timing pressure on the project. The HLC members and Mills discussed roofing issues, which, without 3-D drawings, it was hard to figure out. Deegans asked how adding a whole new element to the house would work, going from old to new. It appears to be more a contracting problem than an architectural one, Mills said. He asked the commission to consider whether the application comes under the purview of the HLC. "The nested gable needs some thought to figure out," Mills said. "A clear ruling on the visibility factor is needed." Without enough information, he said he didn't see a solution as it is.

City of Lewisburg Historic Landmarks Commission Meeting Minutes ~ April 12, 2021 Page 4

Deegans said all the HLC members need to visit the home site to determine whether the project is within the purview of HLC guidelines. If not, Eades can proceed with the renovation without applying for an

approval from the commission. A plan was made to meet with Mills in separate groups so as not to constitute a formal meeting at the site. The agenda item was tabled.

<u>Public Hearing: Paul Lindquist, 1030 Jefferson Street North</u>
<u>Replace front gutter, replace damaged shutters, replace first and second floor porch floors and paint</u>
them gray, paint gables Classic White and add vents to the soffit as needed

Lindquist recused himself for this portion of the meeting. Speaking as the property owner, Lindquist said water spillage has damaged and deteriorated two shutters and to porches on both upper and lower floors. A four-inch down spout will be replaced with a six-inch copper one. Vents will be added where needed and two replacement shutters, painted in Black Forrest Green, have been found. All maintenance and paint will match all original elements. A motion to approve as presented was made by Commission member Gillilian and seconded by Commission member Johns. With three (3) in favor, one recused (1) and one (1) absent, the motion carried.

<u>COMMUNICATIONS from MEMBERS</u>: Lindquist announced the Preservation Alliance of WV has reported the passage of SB 344 - a bill which permanently removes the sunset clause, allowing to maintain West Virginia's 25 percent historic rehabilitation tax credit for income-producing buildings.

Gillilian questioned HLC approval of the usage of aluminum-clad Anderson series E windows (as noted in agenda item #1 above), which he understood were not approved for historic homes. Lindquist said (and Mills agreed) if the windows have the appearance of wood, then aluminum-clad windows are allowed. Deegans said the HLC still advocates for original wood windows if restorable.

PLANNING & ZONING OFFICER: Cunningham reported that TAG Galyean wants to install a generator in the front yard of 1450 Washington Street East. He states that the generator would not be seen because of fencing and shrubbery. The Guidelines of the Historic Landmarks Commission do not allow generators in the front, but Galyean is requesting it to be placed there. Cunningham has asked all of the commissioners to go by the property and let her know how they would like to proceed with an HLC application or not.

Concerning the tabling of the Eades project application, Cunningham stated the HLC has a major problem with inconsistencies in rulings and that the guidelines need upgrading. City Manager Misty Hill said the commission needed to have viewed the project site prior to the meeting and asked whether a decision on the project should be done administratively. Lindquist said HLC will make the determination and will communicate their findings with Eades on HLC's purview of the project.

Hill said HLC will start in person meetings in the Paul R. Cooley Council Chambers beginning on June 14, 2021. The next meeting will be held on May 10, 2021 with a deadline of April 23, 2021.

<u>ADJOURNMENT</u>: The meeting was adjourned at 6:41 p.m. in a motion by Commission member Johns and seconded by Commission member Deegans.

Respectfully submitted, Peggy Mackenzie, Recording Officer