City of Lewisburg Historic Landmarks Commission Meeting Minutes ~ August 12, 2019 Paul R. Cooley Council Chambers 942 Washington Street, West, Lewisburg, WV

PRESENT: Commission Chair Carol Olson; Commission members David Craddock, Skip Deegans, Donna Johns, Paul Lindquist; Architect Consultant Michael Mills, Zoning Officer Gary Ford, Planning & Zoning Clerk Marsha Cunningham, Recording Officer Peggy Mackenzie

<u>VISITORS</u>: Toby Baker, Rebecca Calvert, Jennifer Cherry, Clay Elkins, Jerry Janiga, Paul McClain, City Manager Jacy Faulkner, Martin Schleiff, Emil Stalis, Gary Vermillion, Mayor Beverly White

<u>CALL TO ORDER</u>: The meeting was called to order by Commission Chair Carol Olson at 5 p.m. No comments from the public were offered.

<u>APPROVAL OF MINUTES</u>: The minutes of <u>July 8, 2019</u> were approved as corrected in a motion by Commission member David Craddock and seconded by Commission member Donna Johns. With all in favor, the motion carried.

Public Hearing: The Local, 990 Jefferson Street ~ Install a 48"x36" wall-mounted sign on building

Commissioner Paul Lindquist recused himself from this portion of the meeting.

Proprietor Clay Elkins presented a sample HDU (high density urethane) sign for approval as signage material at The Local, a cafe and store in Montwell Commons, which drew some unfavorable comments from two commissioners for its entirely synthetic material and plastic appearance.

Zoning Officer Gary Ford stated that the sign company referred to HDU as their "top of the line" product, which he said is essentially the same as MDO board, though without any wood product in it, but which is purported to hold up longer (10 years). Architect consultant Michael Mills concurred, stating HDU and MDO are similar and not so different from Hardiplank siding. He said he had no issue or concern with the product as signage material. Chair Olson said Hardiplank's false grain side is never approved, only the smooth is permitted.

Elkins said the Montwell board has not met to address the signage issue, but that both Florian Schleiff and Cliff Baker had okay-ed the sign material. Olson said signage within the complex is not entirely under the HLC's jurisdiction, but there may be consequences in the future for the HLC to approve an all plastic sign. Commission member David Craddock said if Mills and Ford approve, then he would okay it as well.

A motion to approve, with the condition that there is no false grain in the sign, was made by commission member Craddock and seconded by Commission member Johns. With (2) in favor and two (2) opposed and one (1) recused, the motion was denied.

Further discussion ensued. Although the HLC signage guidelines, developed by former Commissioner Gary Roper, included time and effort to produce, sign technology appears to be moving away from the

use of MDO. Jerry Janiga said HDU appears to be the current technology and he has seen it used in elsewhere. City of Lewisburg Historic Landmarks Commission Meeting Minutes ~ August 12, 2019 Page 2

A sub-discussion developed with Commission member Skip Deegan's question about signage confusion at Montwell Commons: "Has the main sign been abandoned?" he asked. Lindquist said Montwell needs to resolve what goes on the main sign, while also identifying the individual buildings in the complex. Olson said she would feel more comfortable if Montwell had a sign policy.

Elkins offered to revise his application and use MDO board if an approval could be reached. Olson said, "If HDU is the future material for signage, it would be unfair to impose a restriction on you." Craddock rescinded his motion, with Johns seconding. With four (4) in favor and one (1) recused, the motion carried. A new motion to approve the HDU sign materials, with the condition that no faux wood grain is displayed, was made by Commission member Craddock and seconded by Commission member Johns. With four (4) in favor and one (1) recused, the motion carried.

Public Hearing: Greenbrier Valley Craft House, 121 Stratton Alley, suite 9 ~ Sign application; presenting two options for wall-mounted sign.

Operations director for the Stratton Alley project Gary Vermillion presented a proposed MDO sign, painted white with a frame of black metal attached with studs to give a three dimensional appearance. A suggestion made by Martin Schleiff to instead create an all-metal sign with the white paint baked in would be more durable and easier to maintain appealed to Vermillion. A motion to approve, with the condition that the application reflect the revised option for an all metal, black and white sign, was made by Commission member Lindquist and seconded by Commission member Johns. With all in favor, the motion carried.

Public Hearing: Wallace and Wallace Funeral Home, 885 Jefferson Street ~ Replace stone wall with same length and heights

Toby Baker detailed the necessary repairs needed to replace a section of a dangerously leaning block boundary wall that abuts the back side of several businesses on Washington Street, which included a 32-inch wide footer, and pilasters to connect the posts and wall sections together. He will use split-faced block to replace old block no longer available and cap it with 10-inch wide blue stone. The 9-foot high, 75-foot long wall will be repainted in the existing color. Concrete will be poured at the base and raised up 3 inches to keep vehicles from contact with the wall. Ford said the wall meets zoning requirements and that the plan will include cleaning up the area and removing a tree and vines. A motion to approve, with the condition a paint chip of the wall color is submitted to Ford, was made by commission member Deegans and seconded by Commission member Lindquist. With all in favor, the motion carried.

Public Hearing: Jennifer Cherry, 301 Harris Street ~ Modify a portion of the exterior of the house by changing the exterior door, remove chimney, remove sun porch windows, close in sun porch and paint the same as the existing color The house on Harris Street, built in 1948, was originally a horse stable, said new owner, Jennifer Cherry. Additions were later added and patched together to turn it into a residence. The structure is currently in disrepair, she said. The alterations Cherry is proposing are mainly to provide accessibility City of Lewisburg Historic Landmarks Commission Meeting Minutes ~ August 12, 2019 Page 3

for a disabled family member in a wheelchair. The exterior changes will include removing a modified chimney, and revising a sun porch for an interior kitchen and ADA bathroom access. The sun porch storm windows will be removed and in their place a single bathroom window will be installed. Deegans said a brochure of the window design would be a requirement. Olson said the structure no longer contributes as an historical element in the historic district. Both Mills and Ford agreed, and Mayor Beverly White stated that any improvement to the structure would welcomed. A motion to approve as presented was made by Commission member Lindquist and seconded by Commission member Johns. With all in favor, the motion carried.

Public Hearing: Greg Allman, 1147 Washington Street ~ Install five Anderson Series E windows (black) and install window trim, also in black

Contractor Martin Schleiff began by saying the lower floor windows are already approved, with his brother Timmo doing the construction. He added that there were a total of seven windows, one already repaired, which might have once been a door. Also mentioning they were 6 over 6, double hung, with new cypress nonfunctional shutters. Deegans said the windows were appropriate for the the age of the building, keeping the same profile, if not in the same materials. He asked if Timmo would be able to replicate the original windows by framing them in wood and install insulated glass. Martin said Timmo could do that, and he and Skip discussed briefly something about a concern that an estimate might go above costs already incurred, which prompted Mills to say that any decision to replace or replicate elements should not be based upon an economic basis, creating "a slippery slope" for the HLC.

Deegans then pointed out an inconsistency issue. The Greenbrier Mercantile building had been required by the HLC to restore the original windows, while Martin's application proposes to replace them with the Anderson windows. Martin asked the HLC to consider an alternative path for a resolution by amending the still active Allman application from July 9, 2018 to read "window replacement" rather than to "restore" them.

A motion was then brought forward to approve the Anderson windows as presented by Commission member Craddock and seconded by Commission member Johns. With two in favor and two opposed, and one (Lindquist) abstaining, the motion was denied and the item was put on the agenda for next month.

Olson then read the July 9, 2018 application (with the pertinent part reading as follows) *restore five double-hung windows on second floor, install new storm windows on second floor, caulk around openings, restore and replace five sets of shutters*)

A motion to revisit the 7-9-18 application was made modifying it to include the use of wood frames, insulated windows and wood replacement shutters. The motion was made by Commission member Lindquist and seconded by Commission member Craddock. With all in favor, the motion carried.

<u>COMMENTS from ZONING OFFICER</u>: Gary Ford stated the West Virginia Parole Commission will be changing the color of their sign. He also said Colin Rose has finished the back porch repair at the Lee Street house and is repainting it the same color as before. The Shuck Baptist Church's front City of Lewisburg Historic Landmarks Commission Meeting Minutes ~ August 12, 2019 Page 4

steps will be replaced and an ADA sign installed for a ramp at the manse.

<u>**COMMUNICATIONS from MEMBERS**</u>: City Manager Jacy Faulkner stated that in preparation for the windows workshop planned for later in the year, grant administrator Pam Brooks is planning to visit Lewisburg for an administrative orientation during the week of September 9, 2019.

Olson announced that the DOH has asked the Historic Landmarks Commission to weigh in on their detailed drawings for the sidewalk work scheduled for Rte. 219 between Foster Street and Austin Street. She said the sidewalk will be ADA compliant, that two large trees will have to be removed and that a few large stone sidewalk slabs will be stored for safe keeping. Olson also said she has the HLC's annual report prepared to go to the State Historic Preservation Society.

A motion to renominate Olson as HLC Chair was made by Commission member Lindquist and seconded by Commission member Deegans. With four (4) in favor and one (1) recusal, the motion carried.

A motion to renominate Lindquist as secretary was made by Commission member Deegans and seconded by Commission member Johns. With four (4) in favor and one (1) recusal, the motion carried.

The next scheduled meeting will be on September 9, 2019.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting was adjourned at 6:35 p.m. in a motion by Commission member Deegans and seconded by Commission member Lindquist.

Respectfully submitted, Peggy Mackenzie Recording Officer