## City of Lewisburg Historic Landmarks Commission Meeting Minutes ~ July 8, 2019 Paul R. Cooley Council Chambers 942 Washington Street, West, Lewisburg, WV

<u>PRESENT</u>: Commission Chair Carol Olson; Commission members David Craddock, Skip Deegans, Donna Johns; Zoning Officer Gary Ford, Planning & Zoning Clerk Marsha Cunningham, City Manager Jacy Faulkner; Recording Officer Peggy Mackenzie

**ABSENT**: Commission member Paul Lindquist, Architect Consultant Michael Mills

<u>VISITORS</u>: Joshua Adamo, Tia Bouman, Jennifer Cherry, Steve Defibaugh, Roger Dolan, Jerry Janiga, Tom Mansheim, Nancy Scurlock, Cliff Sexton, Ian Stalis, Jeff Vickers, Mayor Beverly White

**CALL to ORDER:** The meeting was called to order at 5 p.m. by Commission Chair Carol Olson.

<u>APPROVAL OF MINUTES</u>: The minutes of <u>June 10, 2019</u> were approved as amended in a motion by Commission member Donna Johns and seconded by Commission member Skip Deegans. With four (4) in favor and one (1) absent, the motion carried.

<u>COMMENTS from the PUBLIC</u>: Jennifer Cherry recently purchased a circa 1948 home at 301 Harris Street. The house has two existing additions. She wants to alter one of them to provide accessibility for a disabled family member in a wheelchair. The exterior changes will include removing a chimney and modifying an enclosed porch for an interior kitchen and bathroom access. Cherry provided the commission with visual materials in her presentation.

<u>Public Hearing</u>: Jeff Vickers, 169 Davis Street ~ Install an Anderson series 8, full view, retractable glass front storm door

Jeff Vickers presented photos of the clear glass storm door he intends to install. A motion to approve as presented was made by Commission member David Craddock and seconded by Commission member Johns. With four (4) in favor and one (1) absent, the motion carried.

Public Hearing: Nancy Scurlock, 2025 Washington Street ~ Build a detached, 24x24 garage, frame construction with a window and door on each side, painted the same color as the house, with same color metal roof

The garage will have wood lap siding like the residence. Nancy Scurlock presented a photo of the garage door she wants installed and said she wants to abandon a breeze way connection from garage to house that was part of this application for further consideration. She included a list of materials and showed the HLC samples of the roof paneling and siding. A motion, with conditions that Scurlock provide Zoning Officer Gary Ford and Commission members with a scale architectural drawing of the garage, including front and sides, with images of the exterior lighting, doors and windows, and type and color of guttering and down spouts, was made by Commission member Craddock and seconded by Commission member Johns. With four (4) in favor and one (1) absent, the motion carried.

City of Lewisburg Historical Landmarks Commission Meeting Minutes ~ July 8, 2019 Page 2

## <u>Public Hearing: Nancy Bulla, 1117 Jefferson Street North ~ Tear down old copper gutters</u> and install 6"- 7 1/2" half-round copper gutters

Nancy Bulla made her first presentation for this agenda item at the June HLC meeting when she requested an unofficial approval in order for her to order the copper gutters from Germany. She presented sample of the gutters and said the bar hangers are the same as those on the R&L Trail depot structure on Court Street. A motion to approve as presented was made by Commission member Craddock and seconded by Commission member Deegans. With four (4) in favor and one (1) absent, the motion carried.

## <u>Public Hearing: Bodies in Motion, 102 S. Lafayette Street</u> <u>Materials, windows and roofing to be approved</u>

Architect Tia Bouman stated interior designer Lisa Campbell will be helping with color decisions and detailing for the exterior of the building. A stucco exterior siding with a roof of standing seam flat metal in burnished slate. The windows will be Anderson series E, exterior clad and interior wood finish. A motion to approve was made by Commission member Deegans and seconded by Commission member Johns. With four (4) in favor and one (1) absent, the motion carried.

## <u>Public Hearing: Wild Bean and Thunderbird Taco, 1056 and 1058 Washington Street East</u> <u>Renovation of the store fronts</u>

Architect Jerry Jamiga brought samples of Sapele wood, clear glass, metal awning in three colors and other items as HLC had previously requested at the May meeting. Those items were approved as presented in a motion by Commission member Craddock and seconded by Commission member Johns. With four (4) in favor and one (1) absent, the motion carried.

Janiga, who was brought into the Washington Street project, also presented a multi-page architectural rendering detailing a project summary, perspectives, materials, dimension measurements and scale, historical documentation, lighting fixtures and updated exterior finishings. The commissioners' comments to the presentation were favorable and admiring, with the exception of Commission member Deegans, who was not in attendance at the May meeting. While he liked the presentation, Deegans said he did not like the rigid awnings and suggested the HLC may need to revisit the guidelines, which now limit awnings to canvas or fabric. Contractor for the project Joshua Adamo asked why was that so. The answer: to rid the town of rigid awnings. Zoning Officer Ford said he recently reviewed the historical district and found 23 soft awnings and 15 rigid ones in place since before the 1970s on Court, Jefferson and Washington streets. Chair Olson said the situation presents a struggle to approve this project as presented.

Deegans said it would not be fair to approve this project with the rigid awning when others have had a

fabric awning imposed on them. Janiga said the problem will soon come up again with Patina, down the street, looking at the same rigid awning solution. Fabric is less costly but traffic dust, pollution, fading and deterioration from the sun are all factors. He said he thought new additions to old buildings City of Lewisburg Historic Landmarks Commission Meeting Minutes ~ July 8, 2019 Page 3

should reflect the current time, separating and distinguishing itself from older features.

Olson said the last survey of the area describes the building as "contributing." She said if the application had asked to "repair" the existing materials and to "reconstruct" the awning, "we would have had to allow the awning." Adamo said that at the previous May meeting, the HLC had expressed favor with the project, although construction of the awning was not approved. "The building was originally a car garage!" exclaimed Adamo. Forward motion prompted owner Roger Dolan to hire Janiga to make the architectural presentation as the HLC had requested.

Compromises were attempted: – Deegans suggested delaying the awning installation until a conference with SHPO was arranged, but Adamo said the project has already been delayed and that work on the building must be conducted "top down." – Olson considered not installing an awning over Thunderbird Taco, but Dolan said he wanted to protect the windows and wood paneling. He spoke firmly that he did not like a fabric awning over either storefront. – Janiga brought up a language issue referring to the words like "recommended" versus "required." – Olson said, according to the State Department of the Interior, to invalidate the guidelines could cause a case to be brought against the City. The Mayor could override the HLC guidelines in an individual situation, she said, in order to allow a project with real merit to go forward. "This may be one of those situations." – City Manager Jacy Faulkner weighed in, suggesting to approve, minus the awning, and consult with Architect-Consultant Michael Mills and SHPO. – Ford, in consulting the HLC guidebook, offered more language considerations, stating, "There is a big difference in 'should be' and 'shall be."

Olson reviewed the factors to consider when evaluating a contributing structure's significance: a) was it present during a period of significance, b) did it possess historic integrity reflecting its character at that time or c) is it capable of yielding important information about the period, and /or independently meet the National Register criteria? In order not to invalidate the HLC guidelines, she said the HLC will need to consult with the City's Attorney, Tom White and well as with SHPO and Mills.

The applicants, Dolan, Adamo and Janiga huddled in consultation, and with agreement of the phrasing of the motion, a conditional approval was reached. Faulkner said Mills is familiar with SHPO guidelines and could be comfortable in vouching for SHPO's position. The motion was made to approve with the condition that the proposed awning design by the applicant is depended upon an approval from both the City Attorney and Michael Mills. The motion was made by Commission member Craddock and was seconded by Commission member Johns. With four (4) in favor and one (1) absent, the motion carried.

**Public Hearing**: Montwell Commons, 970 Jefferson Street ~ Build six enclosures for trash cans (Eagle Scout project). Four located at Montwell Commons and two at the Barracks on Randolph Street.

Deegans said the materials will be of rough Hemlock, sawn, and retaining its natural color. A motion to approve as presented was made by commission member Craddock and seconded by Commission member Deegans. With four (4) in favor and one (1) absent, the motion carried.

City of Lewisburg Historic Landmarks Commission Meeting Minutes ~ July 8, 2019 Page 4

**ZONING OFFICER COMMENTS**: Gary Ford reported on two painting projects; one at the John Wesley United Methodist Church where through grant funding, the cupola is being repaired and painted; the other is at the Mt. Tabor Baptist Church where the roof and steeple are being repainted. Ford also stated that a new air conditioner unit has been installed at High Country Gallery.

<u>COMMENTS FROM THE COMMISSION</u>: Deegans reported that there are more signs on display at Montwell Commons. Faulkner said the Planning Commission is working on changes within the sign ordinance, hammering out details with possibly one or two meetings needed to complete the job. Olson said when Planning has completed their work, sharing their results with HLC would be useful for both commissions.

The next scheduled meeting will be held Monday, August 12, 2019 with a deadline of July 26, 2019.

**ADJOURNMENT**: The meeting was adjourned at 6:50 p.m. in a motion by Commission member Deegans and seconded by Commission member Johns.

Respectfully submitted, Peggy Mackenzie, Recording Officer